From Models to Materials: Simulation of Strongly Correlated Electron Systems

# Eva Pavarini

**Institute for Advanced Simulation** 

#### **JARA-HPC**

**Peter Grünberg Institut** 

Forschungszentrum Jülich

JÜLICH





### simulation science master



### simulation science master

focus area: physics

lectures

WS	quantum mechanics
	computational many-body theory
55	correlated systems
WS	symmetries in many-body problem

# physics of strongly-correlated systems



# understand emergent phenomena in electronic systems

what it the aim?

# emergence around you

#### human brain



#### flocking



#### sand dunes





(photos from wikipedia)

### emergence in social media



opinions vs information the earth is flat! alternative *facts* 

# emergence in physics

#### phase transitions

#### ferromagnetism

#### Mott metal-insulator transition



Fe<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> Magnetite T<sub>C</sub>=858 K 1000 BC ? U = 0 U = 0 U = 0 U/W = 0.5 U/W = 0.5 U/W = 0.5 U/W = 1.2 U/W = 1.2 U/W = 2 U/W = 2

G. Kotliar and D. Vollhardt, Physics Today **57**, 53 (2004)

photo from wikipedia

# cannot be described in *independent component* picture

#### human brain



is different from N non-interacting neurons swimming in an average see of information





(photos from wikipedia)

# emergent phenomena arise from strong correlations

# what are strong correlations?

#### when simple interactions among many particles lead to co-operative behavior



#### more is different

The main fallacy in this kind of thinking is that the reductionist hypothesis does not by any means imply a "constructionist" one: The ability to reduce everything to simple fundamental laws does not imply the ability to start from those laws and reconstruct the universe. In fact, the more the ele-

#### Philip Warren Anderson

Nobel Prize in Physics 1977

4 August 1972, Volume 177, Number 4047



# the classical N body problem

(physics/engineering bachelor)

#### the classical case

#### 1-body, no interaction



#### 2-bodies, no interaction





 $V_2$ 

### N-bodies, no interaction



# ideal gas



### interacting classical 2-body problem

two bodies: analytically solvable problem



center of mass and relative coordinates

$$\mathbf{R} = \frac{\mathbf{r}_1 m_1 + \mathbf{r}_2 m_2}{m_1 + m_2} \qquad \mathbf{r} = \mathbf{r}_1 - \mathbf{r}_2$$
$$M = m_1 + m_2 \qquad \mu = \frac{m_1 m_2}{m_1 + m_2}$$





# classical 3-body problem



Oscar II's Prize Competition and the Error in Poincaré's Memoir on the Three Body Problem

JUNE BARROW-GREEN

Communicated by JESPER LÜTZEN

#### Introduction

In the autumn of 1890 HENRI POINCARÉ's memoir on the three body problem [1] was published in the journal *Acta Mathematica* as the winning entry in the international prize competition sponsored by OSCAR II, King of Sweden and Norway, to mark his 60<sup>th</sup> birthday on January 21, 1889. Today POINCARÉ's published memoir is renowned both for providing the foundations for his celebrated three-volume *Méthodes Nouvelles de la Mécanique Céleste* [2] and for containing the first mathematical description of chaotic behavior in a dynamical system.

# interacting classical 3-body problem

chaotic behavior is possible





#### butterfly effect: behavior highly sensitive to initial conditions

the present determines the future,

but the approximate present does not approximately determine the future (Edward Lorenz)

# Sundmann series solution (1907-1912)

For the 3-body problem there is series solution in powers of  $t^{1/3}$  which converges for any  $t^{(*)}$ 

(\*) with exception of some initial conditions



University Press.



Karl Frithiof Sundman

Finnish

The Solution of the *n*-body Problem\*

Florin Diacu

### what about N > 3 ?

The Solution of the *n*-body Problem<sup>\*</sup>

Florin Diacu

[...] It took about 7 decades until the general case was solved. In 1991, a Chinese student, Quidong (Don) Wang, published a beautiful paper [Wa], [D1], in which he provided a convergent power series solution of the *n*-body problem.

Did this mean the end of the *n*-body problem? Was this old question—unsuccessfully attacked by the greatest mathematicians of the last 3 centuries—merely solved by a student in a moment of rare inspiration?

[...] Paradoxically [...] not; in fact we know nothing more than before having this solution.

### exact solution does not help

The Solution of the *n*-body Problem<sup>\*</sup>

Florin Diacu

#### **The Foundations of Mathematics**

What Sundman and Wang did is in accord with the way solutions of initial value problems are defined; everything is apparently all right; but there is a problem, a big one: these series solutions, though convergent on the whole real axis, have very slow convergence. One would have to sum up millions of terms to determine the motion of the particles for insignificantly short intervals of time. The round-off errors make these series unusable in numerical work. From the theoretical point of view, these solutions add nothing to what was previously known about the *n*-body problem.

### emergent behavior: novel approaches



(from NASA website)

#### Kolmogorov–Arnold–Moser theorem

If masses, eccentricities, and inclinations of planets are small enough, many initial conditions lead to quasiperiodic planetary trajectories

# and in quantum mechanics?

# the quantum N-body problem

#### already 1 body is difficult

- uncertainty principle  $\Delta x \Delta v \ge \frac{1}{2} \frac{\hbar}{m}$
- described via wavefunction
- eigenvalue problem & discrete energies

# $\Psi(\mathbf{r}) \quad |\Psi(\mathbf{r})|^2$ $\hat{H}_0 \Psi(\mathbf{r}) = \varepsilon \Psi(\mathbf{r})$

#### 2-bodies non interacting

particles are identical and indistinguishable



 $\hat{H}_0 = \sum \hat{H}_i^0$ 



$$\psi(r_1)\psi(r_2) - \psi(r_2)\psi(r_1)$$

Slater determinant

# quantum N-body problem, no interaction

$$\hat{H}_0 = \sum_i \hat{H}_i^0 \qquad \qquad \hat{H}_i^0 \Psi(r_i) = \varepsilon_i \Psi(r_i) \qquad \qquad E = \sum_i \varepsilon_i$$

$$\Psi = \Psi(r_1)\Psi(r_2)...\Psi(r_N)$$

(classical/mean field)

+ antisymmetrization (Slater determinant)



### the Schrödinger equation



Erwin Rudolf Josef Alexander Schrödinger

$$i\hbar \frac{d}{dt} |\Psi(t)\rangle = \hat{H} |\Psi(t)\rangle$$

$$\hat{H} = \sum_{i} \hat{H}_{i}^{0} + \sum_{i \neq i'} \frac{1}{|\mathbf{r}_{i} - \mathbf{r}_{i'}|} + \hat{H}_{n}$$

$$\hat{H}_i^0 = -\frac{1}{2}\nabla_i^2 - \sum_{i,\alpha} \frac{Z_\alpha}{|\mathbf{r}_i - \mathbf{R}_\alpha|}$$

# the interacting quantum N-body problem

#### the theory of almost everything

$$\hat{H} = \sum_{i} \hat{H}_{i}^{0} + \sum_{i \neq i'} \frac{1}{|\mathbf{r}_{i} - \mathbf{r}_{i'}|} + \hat{H}_{n}$$

kinetic+potential energy electron-electron interaction

$$\hat{H}_i^0 = -\frac{1}{2}\nabla_i^2 - \sum_{i,\alpha} \frac{Z_\alpha}{|\mathbf{r}_i - \mathbf{R}_\alpha|}$$

#### can we solve this problem?

In so far as quantum mechanics is correct, chemical questions are problems in **applied mathematics** 

H. Eyring, J.E. Walter and E. Kimball, Quantum Chemistry, 1949

### if yes, can we make a Great Dream Machine?



however, quantum N-body problem: no exact solution

### ... and the exact solution would be useless



E. Wigner and F. Seitz

If one had a great calculating machine, one might apply it to the problem of solving the Schrödinger equation for each metal [...] It is not clear, however, that a great deal would be gained by this. Presumably the results would agree with the experimentally determined quantities and nothing vastly new would be learned from the calculation. [...].



H.J. Lipkin

On the other hand, the exact solution of a many-body problem is really irrelevant since it includes a large mass of information about the system which although measurable in principle is never measured in practice.

[..] An incomplete description of the system is considered to be sufficient if these measurable quantities and their behavior are described correctly.

E. Pavarini and E. Koch, Autumn School on Correlated Electron 2013, Introduction

### the Practical Great Dream Machine



#### answer to relevant questions

#### the Practical Great Dream Machine

why do atom exist? how can we explain the periodic table? what is the mechanism of high-Tc superconductivity? why are some systems metals and other insulators? what is the mechanism of orbital ordering? no two samples are identical: **generic** features only

### the Practical Great Dream Machine



#### answer to relevant questions

#### give up exact solutions



#### minimal model for a given class of phenomena

#### as system-specific as possible

& find approximate methods that work

#### minimal models that capture the phenomenon





# which phenomena?
# open challenges



high-temperature superconductivity

#### unconventional superconductivity





#### the metal-insulator transition



#### orbital order

#### order-to-disorder



# a key problem: metal or insulator?







#### diamond

silicon

#### copper

photos from wikipedia

### almost empty: 2+2



### low filling: 4+4



### half filling: 8+8







### independent-electron picture

Pauli principle: each level is filled with max two electrons

even number of electrons per site might result in a gapped system (insulator)



### independent-electron picture

odd number of electrons per site yield a system with no gap



# independent-electron picture



# within this picture







diamond

silicon

copper

photos from wikipedia

### interacting particle picture

### almost empty: 2+2



### half filling (1 particle per site): 8+8



### strongly correlated systems

#### paramagnetic Mott insulators are either metals or magnetically ordered insulators in independent electron picture



La	Ce	Pr	Nd	Pm	Sm	Eu	Gd	Tb	Dy	Но	Er	Tm	Yb
Ac	Th	Ра	U	Np	Pu	Am	Cm	Bk	Cf	Es	Fm	Md	No

Coulomb-induced metal-insulator transition heavy-Fermions unconventional superconductivity spin-charge separation

# open challenges



high-temperature superconductivity

#### unconventional superconductivity





#### the metal-insulator transition



#### orbital order

#### order-to-disorder



## how do we describe these phenomena?

### 0. electronic Hamiltonian in 2nd quantization

$$\hat{H}_{e} = -\frac{1}{2} \sum_{i} \nabla_{i}^{2} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i \neq i'} \frac{1}{|\mathbf{r}_{i} - \mathbf{r}_{i'}|} - \sum_{i,\alpha} \frac{Z_{\alpha}}{|\mathbf{r}_{i} - \mathbf{R}_{\alpha}|} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\alpha \neq \alpha'} \frac{Z_{\alpha} Z_{\alpha'}}{|\mathbf{R}_{\alpha} - \mathbf{R}_{\alpha'}|}$$

$$\hat{H}_{e} = \sum_{ab} t_{ab} c_{a}^{\dagger} c_{b} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{cdc'd'} U_{cdd'c'} c_{c}^{\dagger} c_{d}^{\dagger} c_{c'} c_{d'}$$

complete one-electron basis set!

where to learn this: lectures SS

### 1. build minimal models

$$\hat{H}_{e} = \sum_{ab} t_{ab} c_{a}^{\dagger} c_{b} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{cdc'd'} U_{cdd'c'} c_{c}^{\dagger} c_{d}^{\dagger} c_{c'} c_{d'}$$
$$\hat{\tilde{H}}_{e} = \sum_{ab} \tilde{t}_{ab} c_{a}^{\dagger} c_{b}$$

DFT Kohn-Sham *ab-initio* Hamiltonian very good approach for weakly correlated systems where to learn this: lectures SS

### density-functional theory

$$\hat{H} = -\frac{1}{2} \sum_{i} \nabla_{i}^{2} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i \neq i'} \frac{1}{|\mathbf{r}_{i} - \mathbf{r}_{i'}|} - \sum_{i,\alpha} \frac{Z_{\alpha}}{|\mathbf{r}_{i} - \mathbf{R}_{\alpha}|} - \sum_{\alpha} \frac{1}{2M_{\alpha}} \nabla_{\alpha}^{2} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\alpha \neq \alpha'} \frac{Z_{\alpha}Z_{\alpha'}}{|\mathbf{R}_{\alpha} - \mathbf{R}_{\alpha'}|}$$

Kohn-Sham auxiliary Hamiltonian

$$\hat{h}_e = \sum_i \left[ -\frac{1}{2} \nabla_i^2 + v_R(\boldsymbol{r}_i) \right] = \sum_i \hat{h}_e(\boldsymbol{r}_i)$$
$$v_R(\boldsymbol{r}) = -\sum_\alpha \frac{Z_\alpha}{|\boldsymbol{r} - \boldsymbol{R}_\alpha|} + \int d\boldsymbol{r}' \frac{n(\boldsymbol{r}')}{|\boldsymbol{r} - \boldsymbol{r}'|} + \frac{\delta E_{\mathrm{xc}}[n]}{\delta n} = v_{en}(\boldsymbol{r}) + v_H(\boldsymbol{r}) + v_{xc}(\boldsymbol{r})$$



Walter Kohn

Nobel Prize in Chemistry (1998)

Kohn-Sham equations

#### (in practice: LDA,GGA,...)

understand and predict properties of solids, molecules, biological systems, geological systems...

#### where to learn this: lectures SS

# density functional theory



$$E_{xc}[n] = \int d\mathbf{r} \epsilon_{xc}^{\text{LDA}}(n(\mathbf{r})) n(\mathbf{r})$$

homogeneous electron gas

**understand** and predict properties of solids,

molecules, biological systems, geological systems...

Walter Kohn

Nobel Prize in Chemistry (1998)

The practical DFT-based Great Dream Machine weakly correlated systems

### what do the parameters contain?

$$t_{a,b} = -\int d\mathbf{r} \,\overline{\psi_a}(\mathbf{r}) \left[ -\frac{1}{2} \nabla^2 + v_{\mathrm{R}}(\mathbf{r}) \right] \psi_b(\mathbf{r}),$$
  
Hartree  
$$v_R(\mathbf{r}) = -\sum_{\alpha} \frac{Z_{\alpha}}{|\mathbf{r} - \mathbf{R}_{\alpha}|} + \int d\mathbf{r}' \frac{n(\mathbf{r}')}{|\mathbf{r} - \mathbf{r}'|} + \frac{\delta E_{\mathrm{xc}}[n]}{\delta n} = v_{en}(\mathbf{r}) + v_H(\mathbf{r}) + v_{xc}(\mathbf{r})$$
  
potential exchange-correlation



Walter Kohn

Nobel Prize in Chemistry (1998)

Kohn-Sham equations

understand and predict properties of solids, molecules, biological systems, geological systems...

### a big success, new challenges



"the labours and controversies . . . in understanding the chemical binding in materials had finally come to a resolution in favour of 'LDA' and the modern computer" (1998)

but "very deep problems" remain (1998)

# origin of failures: one-electron picture

(RO Jones, *DFT for emergents*, Autumn School on Correlated Electrons 2013)

### more and different



### origin of failures: one-electron picture



can I cure this ? No!

## find alternative one-electron pictures?

half filling (1 particle per site): 8+8













### electron counting argument

one electron per site



$$\varepsilon_{\mathbf{k}} = -2t[\cos k_x + \cos k_y]$$



## find alternative one-electron pictures?

half filling (1 particle per site): 8+8







### electron counting argument

Х

Μ

Γ



 $\varepsilon_{\boldsymbol{k}} = -2t[\cos k_x + \cos k_y]$ 



ΓГ

Х

Μ

Γ

### half filling (1 particle per site): 8+8



one box for star, one for circles?



### how could I open a gap?





works but magnetic...

### origin of failures: one-electron picture



can I cure this ? No!

### we need a new method







### 1. minimal models that capture the phenomenon

$$\hat{H}_e = \sum_{ab} t_{ab} c_a^{\dagger} c_b + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{cdc'd'} U_{cdd'c'} c_c^{\dagger} c_d^{\dagger} c_{c'} c_{d'}$$



### minimal model for metal-insulator transition

$$H = -t \sum_{\sigma} \sum_{\langle ii' \rangle} c^{\dagger}_{i\sigma} c_{i'\sigma} + \sum_{i} U n_{i\uparrow} n_{i\downarrow}$$



Hubbard model at half filling local Coulomb produce strong correlation effects

### Hubbard model at half-filling





- 1. *t*=0: collection of atoms, **insulator**
- 2. *U=0*: half-filled band, **metal**
# 2. find approximate methods that work

#### dynamical mean-field theory



insulating phase

G. Kotliar and D. Vollhardt, Physics Today 57, 53 (2004)

#### **Dynamical Mean-Field Theory (DMFT)**

#### Korrelierte Gitter-Fermionen in hohen Dimensionen

Von der Mathematisch-Naturwissenschaftlichen Fakultät - Fachbereich 1der Rheinisch-Westfälischen Technischen Hochschule Aachen zur Erlangung des akademischen Grades eines Doktors der Naturwissenschaften genehmigte Dissertation

vorgelegt von

Diplom-Physiker

Walter Metzner

aus

München

Referent: Universitätsprofessor Dr. D. Vollhardt Korreferent: Universitätsprofessor Dr. G. Czycholl

Tag der mündlichen Prüfung: 19. Dezember 1989



### 3. make it more realistic: LDA+DMFT



#### where to learn this: lectures SS+ autumn school

#### we need supercomputers!

16384

8192

$$H = -\sum_{ii'} \sum_{mm'} \sum_{\sigma} t_{mm'}^{ii'} c_{im\sigma}^{\dagger} c_{i'm'\sigma}$$

$$+ U \sum_{im} n_{im\uparrow} n_{im\downarrow}$$

$$+ \frac{1}{2} \sum_{im \neq m'\sigma\sigma'} (U - 2J - J\delta_{\sigma\sigma'}) n_{im\sigma} n_{im'\sigma'}$$

$$- J \sum_{m \neq m'} (c_{m\uparrow}^{\dagger} c_{m'\downarrow}^{\dagger} c_{m\uparrow} c_{m\downarrow} + c_{m\uparrow}^{\dagger} c_{m\downarrow}^{\dagger} c_{m'\uparrow} c_{m'\downarrow})$$
**DMFT and cDMFT quantum impurity solvers:**
general HF QMC
general CT-INT QMC
general CT-HYB QMC

speed up 4096  $\tilde{s}(\omega) = \int d\tilde{k} \left(\omega + \mu - H(\tilde{k}) - \Sigma_{c}(\omega)\right)$  $\mathbf{G}_{b}^{-1}(\omega) = \mathbf{\Sigma}_{c}(\omega) + \mathbf{G}^{-1}(\omega)$ 2048 sampling  $\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{c}(\omega) = \mathbf{G}_{b}^{-1}(\omega) - \mathbf{G}_{c}^{-1}(\omega)$ 1024 4096 8192 1024 2048 16384 # CPU QMC time/iteration (a.u.) 1 01 00 ● ● ○ 2 △ 3 ● 5 HF S K-t K-t 20 30 40 50 60 70 β (eV<sup>-1</sup>)

CH

FORSCHUNGSZENTRUM

#### a real-system case: VOMoO<sub>4</sub>



Amin Kiani and Eva Pavarini, Phys. Rev. B 94, 075112 (2016)

### a real-system: VOMoO<sub>4</sub>



# what can we do?



### many fundamental problems still open!

# many fundamental problems still open!

#### high-temperature superconductivity



#### unconventional superconductivity



#### the metal-insulator transition



#### orbital order

#### order-to-disorder



# what can be a seminar topic?

# topics for seminars

- theory: the many-body problem
- model building: tight-binding theory
- model building: Wannier functions
- model building: DFT/LDA bands
- model building: Coulomb tensor
- model solving: DMFT self-consistent loop
- model solving: Hartree-Fock approximation
- model solving: Monte Carlo method
- model solving: 2-site problem, DMFT vs exact solution
- physics: the metal-insulator transition

### seminar example

model building: tight-binding theory

- motivation
- atomic orbitals
- definition of hopping integrals and overlaps
- the case of a linear chain
- the case of a square lattice: HTSCs
- the case of an hexagonal lattice: graphene

outlook: build model for real material

### seminar example

model solving: Monte Carlo method

- motivation
- random numbers and random number generators
- statistical errors
- application: integrals
- applications: Ising model

• outlook: quantum Monte Carlo

# what should you bring?

#### motivation

- interest in physics
- interest in quantum mechanics
- interest in computational science
- interest in mathematics
- knowledge (for physics focus)
  - functions, analysis
  - linear algebra
  - basic statistical mechanics
  - one programming language
  - quantum mechanics
  - knowledge (for seminar)
    - functions, analysis
    - linear algebra
    - understand programming
    - basics quantum mechanics

#### summer term: mandatory (physics)

#### **Computational Many-Body Physics**

- Solid state physics as many-body problem
- Second quantization
- Electron gas
- Hubbard model and *t-J* model
- Two-site Hubbard model
- Matsubara formalism and many-body perturbation theory
- Green function and self-energy
- Mean-field/Hartree-Fock method
- Fermi-liquid theory
- Dynamical mean field theory (DMFT)
- Mott transition





JÜLICH



http://iffwww.iff.kfa-juelich.de/~pavarini/SS/lecture.html

#### summer term: elective

#### **Correlated Electrons**

- Many-electrons in atoms, ions, and molecules
  - direct exchange and Hund's rules
  - kinetic exchange and antiferromagnetism
- crystal-field theory
  - Symmetries in solids
    - JahnTeller effect
- Mott transition and the Hubbard model
  - second quantization and configuration representation

IÜLICH

- limiting cases of the Hubbard model
- Mott insulators
  - t-J model and orbital ordering

www.cond-mat.de/teaching/correl/





JÜLICH

### **Autumn School on Correlated Electrons**

every year in september



17-21 September 201, Forschungszentrum Jülich

# world leading lecturers



















# questions time



















### popular lecture notes















# **Autumn School on Correlated Electrons**

#### http://www.cond-mat.de/events/correl.html



# physics of strongly-correlated systems





thank you!